Holistic Admissions Criteria: Promising Approaches

December 16, 2015

Barbara L Nichols, DNSc (hon) MS, RN, FAAN
Adriana Perez, PhD, RN
Antonia Villarruel, PhD, RN, FAAN
Patricia Polansky, RN, MS
Gloria V. Hawkins, Ph.D.
Greer Glazer, RN, CNP, PhD, FAAN
Today’s Webinar

• Discuss promising admissions practices that can broaden the diversity of a school’s student body.

• Guest speakers who will talk about their initiatives and perspectives include leaders in higher education and the Campaign for Action

Barbara L Nichols, DNSc (hon) MS, RN, FAAN
State Implementation Program Coordinator, Diversity Wisconsin Action Coalition

www.campaignforaction.org/webinars
Today’s Webinar

Antonia M. Villarruel
Ph.D, FAAN
Margaret Bond Simon
Dean of Nursing
University of Pennsylvania

Patricia Polansky
RN, MS
Director, Program Development and Implementation
Center to Champion Nursing in America

Gloria V. Hawkins, Ph.D.
Assistant Vice Chancellor and Director
Chancellor's and Powers-Knapp Scholarship Programs
University of Wisconsin-Madison

Greer Glazer, RN, CNP, PhD, FAAN
Dean, University of Cincinnati College of Nursing
Schmidlapp Professor of Nursing
Education and Diversity

Pat Polansky, RN, MS
Director, Program Development and Implementation
Center to Champion Nursing in America
Education and Diversity
Diversity in Student Populations

• Few nurses from racial/ethnic minority groups with advanced nursing degrees pursue faculty careers. According to 2011 data from AACN’s annual survey, only 11.8% of full-time nursing school faculty come from minority backgrounds, and only 5.1% are male.

www.aacn.nche.edu/IDS
CFA Educational Approaches on Diversity

• Develop Diversity Action Plan.
  – Grounded in the IOM recommendations.
  – Embed diversity throughout AC efforts.
  – Be data-based and data-driven.
  – Evidence-based; use lessons learned from other ACs, institutions and gender, racial/ethnic minority organizations.
  – Include mechanisms to sustain and scale up efforts over time.
CFA Educational Approaches on Diversity

**ACs should:**

- Examine your state’s demographics to consider health challenges and needs in your state.
- Reach out to individuals and organizations that can represent state’s specific needs and contribute to overall work of AC.
Academic Barriers Impacting Diversity

• Feelings of alienation and loneliness (Allen, Nunley, & Scott-Warner, 1988; Suarez & Fowers, 1997)
• Language (Abriam-Yago, Yoder, & Kataoka-Yahiro, 1999; Colling & Liu, 1995; Klisch, 2000)
• Financial difficulties and institutional barriers (Hesser, Pond, Lewis, & Abbot, 1996; Ormeaux, 1990; Sutton, 1999; Villarruel et al., 2001)
• Academics (Kirkland, 1998)
The Utah Action Coalition Exemplar

Joan Gallegos, RN, CSW, Lead Utah Action Coalition for Health, Project Coordinator, Healthsight
Ana C. Sanchez-Birkhead, PhD, WHNP-BC, APRN
Chapter President, Associate Professor, University of Utah, College of Nursing
Allie Miraglia, Project Manager, HealthInsight
Education Meetings
- St. Petersburg, FL (2011)
- Princeton, NJ (2012)
- Sacramento (2012)
- Minneapolis (2012)
- Houston 2015
- Denver 2015
- Salt Lake City (2015)

Upcoming:
- Los Angeles (2016)
holistic admissions

GLORIA V. HAWKINS, PHD
ASSISTANT VICE CHANCELLOR/DIRECTOR
CHANCELLOR’S SCHOLARSHIP PROGRAM
UNIVERSITY OF WISCONSIN - MADISON
What is holistic admissions?

- A comprehensive review of the applicant
- Considers many factors in determining admissions of the student
  - Background
  - Grades and test scores
  - Extra-curriculum activities
  - Overcome challenges
  - Special talents
  - Letters of recommendations
  - Equal consideration given to
  - Grades and test scores
  - Attributes
  - Experiences
INSTITUTION VISION AND MISSION LINKED TO HOLISTIC ADMISSIONS

• The institution’s values and long term goals, as defined in its vision statement, provide the framework or direction for how to move forward.

• The mission defines the institution and provides the context for using holistic admissions in the selection process.
WHY TAKE A HOLISTIC APPROACH TO ADMISSIONS INSTEAD OF USING THE TRADITIONAL PROCESS?

- Traditional Process:
  - Student potential for college success is narrowly defined
    - Primarily grades and test scores
  - Constituents can influence the process
    - Legacy Admissions
    - Athletes as Special Admissions
    - Alumni
    - Donors
    - Other influential constituents

- Holistic Admissions:
  - Provides access to college to a diverse student population
  - Gives equal consideration in the selection process to
    - Grades and test scores,
    - Student experiences,
    - Attributes
  - Linked to both the vision and mission of the institution
WHAT RESPONSIBILITIES DOES THE INSTITUTION OR ACADEMIC UNIT HAVE?

- Provide Educational Opportunities that Prepare Students for College
  - Pipeline Programs
  - Outreach Programs
    - Workshops
    - Campus Visits
    - Presentations at School and Community Events
  - Form partnerships
    - Education institutions (K-12 schools)
    - Community-based Agencies with Educational Components
    - Churches
    - Other community and state-wide programs such as AHEC
- Evaluate how the institution is carrying out its mission
WHAT OUTCOMES DOES THE INSTITUTION/ACADEMIC UNIT WISH TO SEE?

- Return on its investment
- Students that reflect the values of the institution and contribute to the campus community
- Student success – good/increase in retention and graduation rates
- Students that add to the diversity of the campus
- Strong academics and special talents
- Extra-curriculum activities (Leadership and Service)
- Different perspectives and experiences
- Under-represented Groups
- Disadvantaged socio-economic background,
- Racial and ethnic Minorities,
- Other under-represented groups (rural, urban, etc.)
- First generation college students
- Geographic locations
Holistic Admissions: A Promising Admissions Practice

Future of Nursing: Campaign for Action
Diversity Learning Collaborative

Greer Glazer, RN, CNP, PhD, FAAN
Dean, University of Cincinnati College of Nursing
Schmidlapp Professor of Nursing

December 16, 2015

“This project was supported by the National Institute on Minority Health and Health Disparities of the National Institutes of Health (NIH), Award Number U24MD006960, with additional funding support provided by the Health Resources and Services Administration (HRSA). Publication and report contents are solely the responsibility of the authors and do not necessarily represent the official views of the NIH or HRSA.”
What is Holistic Review?

- Flexible, individualized way of assessing an applicant that considers:
  - Student’s life experiences
  - Personal qualities and attributes
  - Traditional measures (e.g., GPA and test scores)
UC Rubric

- Below, meets or exceeds standard
- Traditional measures- GPA, test scores
- Essays- general & nursing
- Experiences & attributes-curricular awards, work and life experience
- Characteristics- i.e. empathy, good communicator, passion
- Social/geographic factors- low SES, first gen Cincinnati, public graduate
Four Core Principles

1. Broad-based selection criteria linked to school mission and goals, and promote diversity as an essential element for excellence.
2. A balance of experiences, attributes, and academic metrics (EAM) are used, and applied equitably across the entire candidate pool. Criteria are grounded in evidence supporting their use beyond academic metrics.
3. Individualized consideration to how each applicant may contribute to the school and the profession.
4. Race/ethnicity may be considered* when narrowly-tailored to the mission and as part of a broader mix of factors.

*Adapted from AAMC materials

*Where permitted by state law
Survey Process

- Electronic survey sent to 163 public universities.
- Primary degree programs in dentistry, medicine, pharmacy, public health and nursing
- Dual approach to assessing use of holistic review (self-reported and objective assessments)
Study Goals: Phase I

- Document extent of use of holistic review in health professions
- Understand impact of holistic review on diversity, student success, and learning environment
Response Rate

- Response rate of 64%
- 228 health professions schools from 104 institutions participated
KEY FINDING #1
Use of holistic review varies by field

75 %
of health professions schools report change

Self-reported use of holistic review by health profession:

- DDS/DMD: 93%
- MD: 91%
- MPH: 82%
- PharmD: 78%
- BSN: 47%
Key Finding #2

The impact of holistic review has been positive overall, and across various metrics of student success.
What is the evidence?

- 72% of survey participants using holistic review that track diversity outcomes (N=132) said diversity of the incoming class had *increased*.
- Average GPA of incoming class (N=136):
  - 38% increased
  - 52% unchanged
  - 10% decreased
What is the evidence?

- Graduation rate (N=104):
  - 16% increased
  - 80% unchanged
  - 4% decreased

- Similar results reported for average GPA of graduating class, and number of attempts needed to pass clinical exams

- These numbers are for all health profession schools using holistic review and evaluating these outcomes.
What about other outcomes?

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Outcome</th>
<th>Outcome tracked AND school is using holistic admission</th>
<th>Outcome tracked AND school is NOT using holistic admission</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Student engagement with the community</td>
<td>64%</td>
<td>16%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Cooperation and teamwork among students</td>
<td>55%</td>
<td>10%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Student openness to ideas different from their own</td>
<td>50%</td>
<td>4%</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Results are for all health profession schools (N=228)
Overall Impact

• Nearly all schools (91%) rated the impact of holistic review as "positive," with the remainder rating impact as "neutral/no discernable impact."
Key Finding #3

Health profession schools focus on diversity in their mission and goal statements, but diversity practices are less prevalent.
Diversity Mission & Practices

- 92% include diversity in mission and/or goals
- 53% include diversity staff on committee
- 51% diversity training
- 49% diversity in admissions statement
- 31% include members of community on committee
Extent of Use of Holistic Review:
BSN respondents

- Many elements: 6%
- Some elements: 38%
- Few or no elements: 56%
BSN program results:

Diversity of the Incoming Class

(N=23)
BSN program results:
Incoming Class Academic Measures

Average GPA of the Incoming Class (N=26)

- Increased: 58%
- Unchanged: 38%
- Decreased: 4%

Average standardized test score of the incoming class (N=19)

- Increased: 42%
- Unchanged: 48%
- Decreased: 10%
BSN program results:
Student Retention

Graduation Rate (N=18)

- Increased: 33%
- Unchanged: 61%
- Decreased: 6%
BSN program results:
Student Academic Performance

Average GPA of the graduating class (N=17)

- Increased: 47%
- Unchanged: 47%
- Decreased: 6%

Average number of attempts needed to pass required licensing exam (N=16)

- Improved: 25%
- Unchanged: 75%
- Worsened: 0%
BSN program results:
Other Measures of Student Success

- Student Engagement with the Community (N=17):
  - Increased: 65%
  - Unchanged: 35%
  - Decreased: 0%

- Cooperation and Teamwork among students (N=16):
  - Increased: 50%
  - Unchanged: 44%
  - Decreased: 6%

- Students' openness to ideas and perspectives different from their own (N=16):
  - Increased: 75%
  - Unchanged: 25%
  - Decreased: 0%
Overall Impact

• 97% of BSN programs that implemented holistic review said that the overall impact was generally “positive.”
• 3% of BSN programs said the impact was “Neutral/no discernible impact”
• 0% said the impact was negative
Study Goals: Phase 2

Why is the use of holistic review so uncommon in nursing?

N=66/131 (50%)
Focus Group Process

• Initial set of two focus groups of nursing deans at AACN March 2014.
• Goal was to identify barriers to implementation of holistic review in nursing
• Second set of focus groups at USU in June 2014 reviewed barriers and proposed solutions
Focus Group #1

Barriers to Implementation

• Lack of knowledge regarding holistic review
• Difficulty obtaining buy-in from leadership and administration
• Insufficient on-campus resources
• Other nursing-specific barriers (e.g. multiple pathways to BSN)
Focus Group #2

Solutions Proposed by Nursing Deans

• Everyone’s buy-in is required
• Need a model for holistic review in nursing
• Need for training and tools
Next Steps

Goal 1: Develop workshops for nursing leaders
- Early phases of developing a training program
- Partnership with HRSA, NIH and AACN
Next Steps

Goal 2: Create a toolkit with products for dissemination

- Self-assessment tools
- Legal guidelines
- Outcomes to track
- Information on non-cognitive criteria (e.g., language, service activities, resilience)
- Legal guidelines
- Sample essay questions
Goal 3: Create a learning community to support continuous improvement

- Learning collaborative of nursing schools
- Online community/web portal
- Webinars
Thank You
Questions or Comments?

Press *1 on your telephone key pad to ask a question
OR
Use the “chat” feature to send “everyone” a question.

You can find the recording, webinar summary, and additional resources by going to: www.campaignforaction.org/webinars.
Upcoming Webinars

Diversity Learning Collaborative WebEx
Every 3rd Wednesday of Month

Next Webinar on Wednesday, January 20
Time 3:00 PM ET – 4:00 PM ET

Topic: To be determined